Table of Contents for Payday Reconsideration NPRM

Feb. 6, 2019 proposal to amend the 2017 final rule governing Payday, Vehicle Title, and Certain High-Cost Installment Loans
(Docket No. CFPB-2019-0006, RIN 3170-AA80)
I. Summary of the Proposed Rule.................................................................................................3

II. Background ........................................................................................................................................7
    A. The Market for Short-Term and Balloon-Payment Loans ....................................................7
       1. Payday Loans ..........................................................................................................................8
       2. Single-Payment Vehicle Title Loans ......................................................................................17
       3. Longer-Term Balloon-Payment Loans ..................................................................................21
    B. The Mandatory Underwriting Provisions of the 2017 Final Rule ..............................................22
    C. The Estimated Impacts of the Mandatory Underwriting Provisions of the 2017 Final Rule ............................................................25

III. Outreach .......................................................................................................................................29

IV. Legal Authority ..................................................................................................................................31

V. Explanation of the Bases for This Proposal to Rescind the Mandatory Underwriting Provisions of the 2017 Final Rule .................................................................................................35
    A. Overview of the Factual Predicates and Legal Conclusions Underlying the Mandatory Underwriting Provisions of the 2017 Final Rule ..............................................................38
       1. Unfairness .............................................................................................................................38
       2. Abusiveness ...........................................................................................................................41
    B. Reconsidering the Evidence for the Factual Findings in Light of the Impacts of the Mandatory Underwriting Provisions ..................................................................................................45
       1. The Mann Study and the Findings Based on It ........................................................................48
       2. Other Evidence on the Consumer Understanding of Risk ......................................................54
       3. The Pew Study and the Finding Based on It ..........................................................................56
       4. Other Evidence Pertaining to Inability to Protect .................................................................60
       5. Conclusion ...........................................................................................................................61
    C. The Legal Findings under Section 1031 of the Dodd-Frank Act ..................................................62
       1. Reasonable Avoidability .......................................................................................................63
2. Countervailing Benefits to Consumers and to Competition .......... 72
   a. Reconsideration of the Dependence of the Unfairness
      Identification on the Principal Step-Down Exemption .......... 73
   b. Effect of Undervaluing Countervailing Benefits .................. 76
      i. Countervailing Benefits to Consumers ...................... 77
      ii. Countervailing Benefits to Competition ................. 83
  3. Lack of Understanding of Material Risks, Costs, or Conditions .... 85
  4. Taking Unreasonable Advantage ........................................ 86
  5. Conclusion ........................................................................... 91
D. Consideration of Alternatives .................................................. 92
E. Conclusion ................................................................................ 94

VI. Section-by-Section Analysis ......................................................... 97
   Subpart A—General ...................................................................... 99
   Section 1041.1 Authority and Purpose ....................................... 99
      1(b) Purpose ................................................................. 99
   Section 1041.2 Definitions ....................................................... 99
      2(a) Definitions .................................................................. 99
      2(a)(5) Consummation .................................................... 99
      2(a)(14) Loan Sequence or Sequence ................................ 99
      2(a)(19) Vehicle Security ................................................ 100
   Section 1041.3 Scope of Coverage; Exclusions; Exemptions ....... 100
      3(e) Alternative Loan ...................................................... 100
      3(e)(2) Borrowing History Condition ............................... 100
      3(e)(3) Income Documentation Condition ......................... 101
   Subpart B—Underwriting ............................................................. 101
   Section 1041.4 Identification of Unfair and Abusive Practice ....... 101
   Section 1041.5 Ability-to-Repay Determination Required .......... 102
Section 1041.6 Conditional Exemption for Certain Covered Short-Term Loans ................................................................. 102

Subpart D—Information Furnishing, Recordkeeping, Anti-Evasion, and Severability .......................................................... 102

Section 1041.10 Information Furnishing Requirements ......................... 102
Section 1041.11 Registered Information Systems ................................. 103
Section 1041.12 Compliance Program and Record Retention .......... 103

12(a) Compliance Program .............................................................. 103
12(b) Record Retention .................................................................. 104

12(b)(1) Retention of Loan Agreement and Documentation Obtained in Connection with Originating a Covered Short-Term or Covered Longer-Term Balloon-Payment Loan ................................................................. 105

12(b)(2) Electronic Records in Tabular Format Regarding Origination Calculations and Determinations for a Covered Short-Term or Covered Longer-Term Balloon-Payment Loan under § 1041.5 ......................................................... 106

12(b)(3) Electronic Records in Tabular Format Regarding Type, Terms, and Performance for Covered Short-Term or Covered Longer-Term Balloon-Payment Loans...... 106

12(b)(5) Electronic Records in Tabular Format Regarding Payment Practices for Covered Loans................................. 107

Appendix A to Part 1041—Model Forms ................................................. 107

A-1 Model Form for First § 1041.6 Loan ............................................. 107
A-2 Model Form for Third § 1041.6 Loan ........................................... 108

VII. Compliance and Effective Dates ................................................................. 108

VIII. Dodd-Frank Act Section 1022(b)(2) Analysis ................................. 109

A. Overview ...................................................................................... 109

1. The Need for Federal Regulatory Action ................................ 109
2. Data and Evidence ...................................................................... 110
4. Description of the Baseline ................................................................. 113
5. Major Impacts of the Proposal ........................................................... 119

B. Potential Benefits and Costs of the Proposal to Consumers and Covered Persons—Provisions Relating Specifically to Ability-to-Repay Determinations for Covered Short-Term and Longer-Term Balloon-Payment Loans .......................................................... 124

1. Benefits and Costs to Covered Persons .............................................. 126
   a. Revocation of the Operational Requirements Associated with Mandatory Underwriting ...................................................... 126
   b. Operational Requirements—Principal Step-Down Approach .. 129
   c. Effect on Loan Volumes and Revenue from Eliminating Underwriting Requirements and Restrictions on Certain Reborrowing .......................................................................... 130

2. Benefits and Costs to Consumers ...................................................... 133
   a. Benefits to Consumers and Access to Credit ............................. 133
   b. Costs to Consumers ..................................................................... 141
   c. New Evidence on the Benefits and Costs to Consumers of Access to Payday and Other Covered Short-Term and Longer-Term Balloon-Payment Loans ........................................................ 149

C. Potential Benefits and Costs of the Proposal to Consumers and Covered Persons—Recordkeeping Requirements ................................................. 155

1. Benefits and Costs to Covered Persons .............................................. 156
2. Benefits and Costs to Consumers ....................................................... 156

D. Potential Benefits and Costs of the Proposal to Consumers and Covered Persons—Requirements Related to Information Furnishing and Registered Information Systems .................................................. 156

1. Benefits and Costs to Covered Persons .............................................. 156
2. Benefits and Costs to Consumers ....................................................... 157

E. Other Unquantified Benefits and Costs ..................................................... 157
F. Potential Impact on Depository Creditors With $10 Billion or Less in Total Assets ................................................................. 159

G. Potential Impact on Consumers in Rural Areas................................. 160

IX. Regulatory Flexibility Act Analysis ....................................................... 162

X. Paperwork Reduction Act ....................................................................... 164

List of Subjects in 12 CFR Part 1041 .......................................................... 165

Authority and Issuance ............................................................................ 165

PART 1041—PAYDAY, VEHICLE TITLE, AND CERTAIN HIGH-COST INSTALLMENT LOANS ......................................................................................... 165

Subpart A—General.................................................................................. 165

Subpart B—[REMOVE AND RESERVE] .................................................. 165

Subpart D—Recordkeeping, Anti-Evasion, and Severability ................... 165

§ 1041.12 Compliance program and record retention............................... 165

Supplement I to Part 1041—Official Interpretations............................... 167

Section 1041.2—Definitions..................................................................... 167

Section 1041.3—Scope of Coverage; Exclusions; Exemptions ............ 167

Section 1041.12—Compliance Program and Record Retention .......... 169